

1 Galen D. Bellamy (SBN: 231792)
bellamy@wtotrial.com
2 Jacob A. Rey (*pro hac vice*)
rey@wtotrial.com
3 Jacob D. Taylor (*pro hac vice*)
taylor@wtotrial.com
4 Wheeler Trigg O'Donnell LLP
370 Seventeenth Street, Suite 4500
5 Denver, CO 80202-5647
Telephone: 303.244.1800
6 Facsimile: 303.244.1879

7 Dean J. Zipser (SBN: 94680)
DZipser@umbergzipser.com
8 Adina W. Stowell (SBN: 211719)
AStowell@umbergzipser.com
9 Umberg Zipser LLP
1920 Main Street, Suite 750
10 Irvine, CA 92614
Telephone: 949.679.0052
11 Facsimile: 949.679.0461

12 Attorneys for Plaintiffs & Counter-Defendants
13 Coronis Health RCM, LLC and Practical Holdings,
LLC

14 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
15 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

16 CORONIS HEALTH RCM, LLC; and
17 PRACTICAL HOLDINGS, LLC, F/K/A
18 PRACTISOURCE, LLC,

19 Plaintiffs and Counter-
Defendants,

20 vs.

21 NEXTGEN LABORATORIES, INC,

22 Defendant and Counter-
23 Claimant.

Case No.: 8:23-cv-00111-FWS-DFM
Assigned to Hon. Fred W. Slaughter

**ORDER ON STIPULATED ORDER
REGARDING DISCOVERY OF
ELECTRONICALLY STORED
INFORMATION**

Date Filed: December 2, 2022

Date Removed: January 18, 2023

Trial Date: Not set

25 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by the parties, through their
26 respective counsel, subject to the approval of the Court, that the following Stipulated
27 Order Regarding the Discovery of Electronically Stored Information (the "Stipulated
28 ESI Protocol" or the "Protocol") be entered by this Court:

STIPULATED ESI PROTOCOL

1. Purpose

A. This Order will govern the discovery of electronically stored information (“ESI”) as a supplement to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, this Court’s Guidelines for the Discovery of Electronically Stored Information, and any other applicable orders and rules.

2. Cooperation

A. The parties commit to cooperate in good faith throughout the matter. The parties are expected to use reasonable, good-faith efforts to preserve, identify, and produce relevant and discoverable information. This includes identifying custodians, time periods for discovery, and keyword parameters to guide preservation and discovery.

3. Non-Waiver.

A. To reduce the costs and burdens of discovery, the parties have entered into a non-waiver agreement encompassing all elements and protections of Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d), thereby reducing pre-production review costs and reducing costly and costly time-consuming motions in the event of inadvertent production.

4. Proportionality

A. The parties will consider the proportionality standard set forth in Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(2)(C) in formulating their discovery plan. To further the application of the proportionality standard in discovery, requests for production of ESI and related responses should be reasonably targeted, clear, and as specific as practicable. The parties will consider the option of prioritizing certain discovery where appropriate.

5. ESI Discovery Plan.

A. On or before May 22, 2023, or at a later time if agreed to by the Parties, each Party shall designate and disclose to each other the following (the “Proposed ESI Plans”):

- i. Custodians. The name and title of each custodian the Party intends to search for discoverable ESI, including (but not limited to) Email communications.
- ii. Non-custodial Data Sources. A list of non-custodial data sources (e.g., shared drives, servers (including email servers such as Exchange), document management systems, cloud-based folders, databases, third-party data sources, etc.) the Party intends to search for discoverable ESI.
- iii. Search Terms. A list of the search terms, if any, that the Party intends to apply to restrict or limit its review and/or production of documents from each data source it identifies and which Requests for Production each search term (or terms) corresponds.
- iv. Search Term Hit Report. To facilitate agreement on search terms and the resolution of disputes, the producing party shall timely disclose hit reports for (1) its proposed search terms or modifications and (2) terms or modifications proposed by the requesting party. The hit report shall include the number of documents that hit on each string, the number of unique documents that hit on each string (documents that hit on a particular string and no other string on the list), and the total number of documents that would be returned by using the proposed search term list, both with and without families. The hit reports shall be run after the producing party globally de-duplicates documents.
- v. Date Limitations. The date limitations, if any, the Party intends to apply to restrict or limit its review and/or production of documents from each data source it identifies, including identification of any specific search terms or custodians that date limitations will restrict.

1 vi. Technology Assisted Review (“TAR”). If a Party intends to use
 2 TAR to assist any portion of its review process, it shall disclose its
 3 proposed TAR protocols.

4 vii. Inaccessible Data. A list of all data sources, if any, that are
 5 reasonably identifiable and likely to contain discoverable ESI (by
 6 type, date, custodian, electronic system, or other criteria sufficient
 7 to specifically identify the data source) that a Party asserts are not
 8 reasonably accessible.

9 **6. Duty of Producing Party**

10 A. The Parties agree that if a producing Party is aware, or becomes aware, of
 11 relevant or responsive ESI that was not extracted, identified, or produced under the
 12 Party’s Proposed ESI Plan (e.g., the custodians identified or the search terms used did
 13 not result in the identification or production of the ESI) the producing Party will
 14 produce such ESI.

15 **7. Preservation of ESI**

16 A. The Parties acknowledge that they must take reasonable and proportional
 17 steps to preserve discoverable information in the party’s possession, custody, or
 18 control.

19 B. The parties agree that the circumstances of this case do not warrant the
 20 preservation, collection, review, or production of ESI that is not reasonably accessible
 21 because they anticipate that enough relevant information can be yielded from
 22 reasonably accessible sources and, as necessary and appropriate, supplemented with
 23 deposition discovery. Moreover, the remote possibility of additional relevant
 24 information existing in not reasonably accessible sources is substantially outweighed
 25 by the burden and cost of preservation, collection, review, and production of ESI from
 26 sources that are not reasonably accessible. The parties agree that the following ESI is
 27 not reasonably accessible:
 28

- i. Data maintained or duplicated in any electronic backup system for system recovery or information restoration, including but not limited to system recovery backup tapes or other media, continuity of operations systems, and data or system mirrors or shadows, if such data are routinely purged, overwritten or otherwise made not reasonably accessible per an established routine system maintenance policy.
- ii. Unallocated, slack space, deleted data, file fragments, or other data accessible by use of computer forensics;
- iii. Random access memory (RAM), temporary files, or other ephemeral data that is difficult to preserve;
- iv. Data relating to online access, such as temporary Internet files, browser history, file or memory caches, and cookies;
- v. Data in metadata fields that are frequently updated automatically as part of the usual operation of a software application, operating system, or network (e.g., data last opened) provided, however, that such metadata as it exists at the time of preservation shall be retained, produced, and not altered by the production process unless it is separately preserved and produced with the relevant document;
- vi. Telephone or VOIP voice messages that are not regularly stored or saved, unless any such messages were otherwise stored or saved;
- vii. Instant messages such as messages sent on Lync Online, Microsoft Communicator, or any other instant message platform if not maintained in the ordinary course of business.
- viii. Data stored on cell phones or mobile devices, excluding tablets, that is more reasonably accessible elsewhere, provided that the alternative location is identified . The producing party shall

1 produce such data from reasonably accessible sources, along with
 2 documentation of the specific device on which it is located. The
 3 producing party shall do so without any additional request for
 4 production from the receiving party. Further, all such devices that
 5 were identified and that contain data that was not preserved shall
 6 be identified;

7 ix. Call history records maintained on mobile devices, cell phones, or
 8 Blackberries so long as copies of telephone bills that contain such
 9 records are preserved and made available when responsive;

10 x. Operating system files, executable files, and log files (including
 11 web server, web services, system, network, application log files,
 12 and associated databases, analysis output caches, and archives of
 13 such data), unless such log files may be used to identify putative
 14 class members; and

15 xi. Other forms of ESI whose preservation requires extraordinary
 16 affirmative measures that are not utilized in the ordinary course of
 17 business.

18 C. Absent a showing of good cause, no party need restore any form of media
 19 upon which backup data is maintained in a party's normal or allowed processes,
 20 including but not limited to backup tapes, disks, SAN, and other forms of media, to
 21 comply with its discovery obligations in the present case. To avoid doubt, CDs,
 22 DVDs, or other media used in the ordinary course of business to store original data
 23 shall be searched for responsive material.

24 **8. Sources of ESI**

25 A. The parties agree to limit searches of discoverable ESI as follows.
 26 Searches of ESI shall be limited to up to 6 custodians per party. Each party shall
 27 designate its own custodians and, upon designation, disclose the identities of the
 28 custodians to the other party. If a party requests ESI from more than 6 custodians, the

1 requesting party shall reimburse the producing party for the additional expenses of
2 searching for, collecting, reviewing, and producing any additional ESI. The time
3 period for ESI searches shall be limited to the time period of May 1, 2021, to January
4 18, 2023.

5 B. The parties further agree to be bound by the Stipulated Protective Order
6 during the sharing of ESI. Nothing in this Stipulated ESI Protocol precludes any party
7 from challenging the admissibility, discoverability, production, relevance, or
8 confidentiality of information produced under this Protocol or otherwise objecting to
9 its production or use at trial.

10 C. No party may seek relief from the Court concerning compliance with the
11 Protocol unless it has conferred with the party it believes to be in noncompliance with
12 the Protocol.

13 D. If necessary, the Stipulated ESI Protocol shall be amended by written
14 modification of all parties.

15 **9. General Production Format**

16 A. The parties will produce ESI in TIFF image format, with the exception of
17 documents that contain color images, which shall be produced in JPEG format,
18 provided that the documents do not become illegible or unusable or in any way alter
19 existing metadata when converted to TIFF image format. Any party may request
20 production of the native format of any document produced in any non-native format.
21 If a dispute arises regarding the reasonableness of the request, the parties agree to
22 meet and confer to resolve their differences.

23 B. Certain file types become illegible or unusable when converted to TIFF
24 image format (Microsoft Excel files, other similar spreadsheet application files,
25 Microsoft Project, and audio and video files), and these files must be produced in
26 native format unless they contain information that requires redaction. The parties
27 reserve their rights to seek additional electronic documents in their native format,
28 including natively redacted spreadsheet documents that preserve the searching,

1 sorting, and filtering characteristics intrinsic to spreadsheet functionality. Electronic
2 documents should be produced in such a fashion as to identify the location (i.e., the
3 network file folder, hard drive, backup tape, or other location) where the documents
4 are stored and, where applicable, the natural person in whose possession they were
5 found (or on whose hardware device they reside or are stored).

6 C. All production documents will be produced with extracted text and load
7 files, including the data fields provided in **Exhibit A**. In those instances where
8 redaction is used, OCR text will be provided instead of the extracted text to allow for
9 the removal of the redacted text from production. For documents produced in native
10 format, in addition to producing extracted text and the data fields in the table below,
11 the producing party will provide slip sheets endorsed with the production number and
12 level of confidentiality pursuant to any applicable protective orders in this case.

13 D. Non-electronic documents shall be scanned into a static-image format.
14 Copies of file folders and identification of file custodians shall be produced.

15 E. For documents that have originated in paper format, the following
16 specifications should be used for their production.

- 17 i. Each filename must be unique and match the Bates number of the
18 page. The filename should not contain any blank spaces and should
19 be zero-padded (for example, ABC00000001).
- 20 ii. Media may be delivered on CDs, DVDs, external USB hard drives,
21 or via secure FTP. Each media volume should have a unique name
22 and a consistent naming convention (for example, ZZZ001 or
23 SMITH001).
- 24 iii. Each delivery should be accompanied by an image cross-reference
25 file that contains document breaks.
- 26 iv. Each metadata and coding field set forth below that can be
27 extracted shall be produced for each document. The parties are not
28 obligated to populate manually any of the fields below if such

fields cannot be extracted from a document, except the following:
 (a) PRODBEG, (b) PRODEND, (c) BEGATT, (d) ENDATT, (e)
 CUSTODIAN, (f) ALL CUSTODIAN, (g) NATIVEFILEPATH,
 (h) TEXTFILEPATH, and (i) HASHVALUE, which should be
 populated by the party or the party's vendor. The parties will make
 reasonable efforts to ensure that metadata fields automatically
 extracted from the documents correspond directly to the
 information that exists in the original documents.

- v. The standard delimiters for the metadata load file should be:
- Field Separator, ASCII character 020: “ ”
- Quote Character, ASCII character 254 “p”
- Multi-Entry Delimiter, ASCII character 059: “;”

10. Image Format

A. Documents that are converted to TIFF image format will be produced in
 accordance with the following technical specifications:

- i. Images will be single-page, Group IV TIFF image files at 300 dpi;
- ii. TIFF file names cannot contain embedded spaces;
- iii. Bates numbers should be endorsed on the lower right corner of all
 TIFF images and will be a unique, consistently formatted
 identifier, i.e., alpha prefix, along with a fixed length number (e.g.,
 ABC0000001). The number of digits in the numeric portion of the
 bates number format should not change in subsequent productions.
- iv. Confidentiality designations, if any, will be endorsed on the lower
 left corner of all TIFF images;

B. Images will be delivered with an image load file in the Opticon (.OPT)
 file format.

C. Images, native files, and text files should be stored and delivered in
 separate folders named “IMAGES,” “TEXT,” and “NATIVE.” Folders should be

1 segmented into directories, not to exceed 5,000 files.

2 **11. Searchable Text**

3 A. Searchable text of entire documents will be produced as an extracted text
4 for all documents originating in electronic format or, for any document from which
5 text cannot be extracted, as text generated using Optical Character Recognition (OCR)
6 technology. OCR text will be provided for all documents that originate from hard
7 copy or paper format. The full text of the redacted version of the document will be
8 produced for redacted documents.

9 B. Searchable text will be produced as a document-level multi-page ASCII
10 text file with the text file named the same as the PRODBEG field, placed in a separate
11 folder. The full path of the text file must be provided in the .DAT file for the TEXT
12 field.

13 **12. Native Files**

14 A. Native file documents, emails, or attachments may be included with the
15 electronic production using the below criteria:

- 16 i. Documents produced in native format shall be re-named to reflect
17 the production number.
18 ii. The full path of the native file must be provided in the .DAT file
19 for the NATIVE FILE field;
20 iii. The confidentiality designation under the Stipulated Protective
21 Order to be entered in this action will be produced in the load file
22 in the CONFIDENTIALITY field.

23 B. If documents produced in native format are printed for use in deposition,
24 motion, or hearing, the party printing the document must label the front page of the
25 file that is printed with the corresponding production number and, if applicable, the
26 confidentiality designation assigned by the producing party to that file under an
27 applicable protective order to be entered in this action.

28 C. Excel spreadsheets should be produced in native format with lock/protect

features and password protection disabled.

13. Embedded Objects

A. The parties may exclude embedded objects from the production.

B. Following the production of the files containing embedded objects, a receiving party may make reasonable requests concerning specific embedded objects particularly identified in the requests for the production of these embedded objects as stand-alone files. The producing party shall cooperate reasonably in responding to any such requests.

14. Structured Data

A. To the extent a response to discovery requires the production of electronic information stored in a database, the parties will confer to attempt to agree upon methods of production that will best provide all relevant information.

B. To determine the data that is relevant to the document requests, a list of databases and systems used to manage potentially relevant data should be provided on the date specified above with the following information. To the extent a database contains both responsive and non-responsive information, only potentially responsive information needs to be disclosed:

Database Name
 Type of Database
 Software Platform
 Software Version
 Business Purpose
 A List of Standard Reports
 Database Owner or Administrator's Name

C. The parties will consider whether all relevant information may be provided by querying the database for discoverable information and generating a report in a reasonably usable and exportable electronic file. If the parties agree to production in this fashion, a document reference sheet shall be provided to describe the purpose of the database and the meaning of all tables and column headers

1 contained in the report.

2 **15. De-Duplication**

3 A. Documents shall be de-duplicated across custodians before production.
4 The parties agree to use a verifiable de-duplication process to ensure that one copy of
5 a document is produced when feasible. A producing party shall identify all custodians
6 possessing de-duplicated documents in the “ALL CUSTODIAN” field, listed in
7 **Exhibit A.**

8 B. For the avoidance of doubt, a document is not considered to be a
9 duplicate in the case where email headers or attachments differ in any regard or where
10 the same document is both attached to an email and exists in a form that is separate
11 from such email (e.g., as an attachment to another email, as a standalone document
12 saved to some electronic media, etc.).

13 C. For good cause shown, the receiving party shall have the right to request
14 all duplicates of a produced document.

15 **16. Email Threads**

16 A. Email threads are email communications that contain prior or lesser-
17 inclusive email communications that also may exist separately in the party’s electronic
18 files. A most inclusive email thread is one that contains all of the prior or lesser-
19 inclusive emails, including attachments, for that branch of the email thread.

20 B. Each party may produce only the most inclusive email threads.

21 C. Similarly, a party may list the most inclusive email thread on any
22 required privilege log. However, if the most inclusive email thread contains privileged
23 portions and would otherwise be logged in its entirety as privileged, then the thread
24 must be produced with privileged material redacted and the redacted portion logged.

25 D. Following the production of the most-inclusive email threads, a receiving
26 party may make reasonable requests, concerning most-inclusive email threads
27 particularly identified in the requests, for the production of individual lesser-inclusive
28 emails. The producing party shall cooperate reasonably in responding to any such

1 requests.

2 **17. Standard for Addressing Privilege**

3 A. Under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) and (e), the production of a privileged or
4 work-product-protected document, whether inadvertent or otherwise, is not a waiver
5 of privilege or protection from discovery in the pending case or any other federal or
6 state proceeding. Disclosures among defendants' attorneys of work product or other
7 communications relating to issues of common interest shall not affect or be deemed a
8 waiver of any applicable privilege or protection from disclosure. For example, the
9 mere production of privileged or work-product-protected documents in this case as
10 part of mass production is not itself a waiver in this case or any other federal or state
11 proceeding. A producing party may assert privilege or protection over produced
12 documents at any time by notifying the receiving party in writing of the assertion of
13 privilege or protection. The receiving party must return, sequester, or destroy ESI that
14 the producing party claims is privileged or work product protected as provided in Rule
15 26(b)(5)(B) and may use such ESI only to challenge the claim of privilege or
16 protection.

17 B. Activities undertaken in compliance with the duty to preserve
18 information are protected from disclosure and discovery under Fed. R. Civ. P.
19 26(b)(3)(A) and (B).

20 C. Communications involving inside or outside counsel for the parties
21 related to this case that post-date the filing of the complaint need not be placed on a
22 privilege log.

23 D. The parties agree to furnish logs that comply with Fed. R. Civ. P.
24 26(b)(5) and any other legal requirements for all documents withheld or redacted on
25 the basis of privilege, attorney work product, or similar doctrines. Privilege logs may
26 be produced on a rolling basis or after all productions are complete but before the
27 close of discovery.

28 E. Nothing in this Order shall be interpreted to require disclosure of

1 irrelevant information or relevant information protected by the attorney-client
2 privilege, work-product doctrine, or any other applicable privilege or immunity. The
3 parties do not waive any objections to the production, discoverability, admissibility, or
4 confidentiality of documents and ESI.

5 **18. Effect of Protocol and Reservation of Rights**

6 A. The parties agree to be bound by this Order during the sharing of ESI.
7 Nothing in this Protocol precludes any party from challenging the admissibility,
8 discoverability, production, or confidentiality of information produced under this
9 Protocol or otherwise objecting to its production or use during the merits hearing or
10 during any other hearing.

11 B. No party may seek relief from the Court concerning compliance with the
12 Protocol unless it has first conferred with the other parties.

13 C. The Protocol may be amended by the written agreement of the parties.

14 D. Nothing in this Protocol shall be interpreted to require disclosure of
15 irrelevant information or relevant information protected by the attorney-client
16 privilege, work-product doctrine, or any other applicable privilege or immunity.

17 E. The parties shall confer on an appropriate non-waiver order pursuant to
18 Fed. R. Evid. 502. Until a non-waiver order is entered, information that contains
19 privileged matter or attorney work product shall be immediately returned to the
20 producing party (i) if such information appears on its face that it may have been
21 inadvertently produced or (ii) if the producing party provides notice within 15 days of
22 discovery by the producing party of the inadvertent production.

23 F. Nothing contained herein is intended to or shall serve to limit a party's
24 right to conduct a review of documents, ESI, or information (including metadata) for
25 relevance, responsiveness, and/or segregation of privileged and/or protected
26 information before production.

1 Dated: May 19, 2023

2
3 IT IS SO ORDERED:

4
5
6 

7
8 Hon. Douglas F. McCormick
9 United States District Court

10
11
12 Dated: May 19, 2023

13 By: /s/Jacob A. Rey

14 Galen D. Bellamy
15 Jacob A. Rey (*pro hac vice*)
16 Jacob D. Taylor (*pro hac vice*)

17 Attorneys for Plaintiffs & Counter-Defendants
18 Coronis Health RCM, LLC and Practical
19 Holdings, LLC

20
21
22 Dated: May 19, 2023

23 By: /s/ Seth B. Orkland

24 Katie J. Brinson
25 Seth B. Orkland (*pro hac vice*)
26 Edward J. Heath (*pro hac vice*)

27 Attorneys for Defendant & Counter-Claimant
28 NextGen Laboratories, Inc.

EXHIBIT A

| | Field | Definition | Applicable Doc Type |
|----|--|--|----------------------------|
| 1 | CUSTODIAN | Name of person or data source from where documents/files are produced. Where redundant names occur, individuals should be distinguished by an initial which is kept constant throughout productions (e.g., Smith, John A. and Smith, John B.). | All |
| 2 | PRODBEG | Beginning Bates number (production number) | All |
| 3 | PRODEND | Ending Bates number (production number) | All |
| 4 | BEGATT | First Bates number of family range (i.e. Bates number of the first page of the parent email) | All |
| 5 | ENDATT | Last Bates number of family range (i.e. Bates number of the last page of the last attachment) | All |
| 6 | PGCOUNT | Number of pages in the document | All |
| 7 | ATTACHCOUNT | Number of attachments to an email | All |
| 8 | FILENAME | Name of original file name of an E-Doc or attachment to an email | E-docs |
| 9 | DOCEXT | File extension of the document | All |
| 10 | MSGID | Value extracted from parent message during processing | Email |
| 11 | EMAILFROM | Sender | Email |
| 12 | EMAILTO | Recipient | Email |
| 13 | EMAILCC | Additional recipients | Email |
| 14 | EMAILBCC | Blind additional recipients | Email |
| 15 | EMAILSUBJECT | Subject line of email | Email |
| 16 | DATE-TIME SENT (mm/dd/yyyy hh:mm:ss) | Date and time sent | Email |
| 17 | DATE-TIME RCVD (mm/dd/yyyy hh:mm:ss) | Date and time received | Email |

| | Field | Definition | Applicable Doc Type |
|----|-----------------------------|---|---------------------|
| 18 | HASHVALUE | MD5 Hash Value | Email, Edocs |
| 19 | TITLE | Title provided by user within the document | Edocs |
| 20 | AUTHOR | Creator of a document | Edocs |
| 21 | DATECRTD (mm/dd/yyyy) | Creation date | Edocs |
| 22 | DATELASTMOD (mm/dd/yyyy) | Last modified date | Edocs |
| 23 | DOCTYPE | Descriptor of the type of document: “ E-document ” for electronic documents not attached to emails; “ Emails ” for all emails; “ E-attachments ” for files that are attachments to emails; and “ Paper ” for hard copy physical documents that have been scanned and converted to an electronic image | All |
| 24 | REDACTED | Descriptor for documents that have been redacted. “Yes” for redacted documents; “No” for unredacted documents. | All |
| 25 | PRODVOL | Name of media that data was produced on. | All |
| 26 | CONFIDENTIALITY | Indicates if the document has been designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to any applicable Protective Order. “No” indicates those documents that are not so designated. | All |
| 27 | TEXTPATH | Full path for OCR or Extracted Text files on producing media | All |
| 28 | NATIVEFILELINK | Full path for documents provided in native format on producing media | Edocs |
| 29 | ALL CUSTODIAN | Name(s) of all custodian(s) that | Email |

| | | | |
|----|--------------|--|----------------------------|
| | Field | Definition | Applicable Doc Type |
| | | possessed the document; includes any custodian(s) whose duplicate file(s) was removed during processing. | |
| 30 | FOLDERPATH | File source path for all electronically collected documents and emails, which includes location, folder name and file extension. | Edocs |